



Investment Consulting in Institutional Asset Management

Conceptual Design and Empirical Analysis from a Global Perspective
with Particular Focus on Manager Selection

Dr. Bastian Runge

Frankfurt am Main | Germany

www.ic-research.org

Table of Contents – Overview

Author	III
Table of Contents – Overview	V
Table of Contents – Details	VII
Table of Figures	XI
List of Abbreviations	XVII
1 Introduction	1
1.1 Problem Statement and Research Needs.....	1
1.2 Targets and Theoretical Framework of Reference.....	8
1.3 Scientific Method and Process of Investigation.....	14
2 Conceptual Basis	23
2.1 Asset Management.....	23
2.2 Institutional Investors.....	30
2.3 Investment Consulting.....	37
2.4 Summary.....	51
3 Defining Dimensions of Demand	53
3.1 Scientific Components of Explanation.....	53
3.2 Practice-Oriented Explanation Components.....	71
3.3 Summary.....	87
4 Service Components of Supply	89
4.1 Business Model and Value Chain.....	89
4.2 Manager Selection.....	125
4.3 Summary.....	199
5 Definition of Environmental Dimensions	201
5.1 Exogenous Trends and Drivers.....	203
5.2 Endogenous Trends and Drivers.....	213
5.3 Summary.....	221
6 Defining Dimensions of Interactions	223
6.1 Provider Selection in Investment Consulting.....	223
6.2 Dealing with Providers in Investment Consulting.....	236
6.3 Value-added by Investment Consulting.....	240
6.4 Summary.....	254

7 Empirical Investigation into Investment Consulting	256
7.1 Objectives of the Empirical Investigation.....	256
7.2 Subjects and Scope of the Empirical Investigation	258
7.3 Empirical Investigation – The Results	281
7.4 Summary	398
8 Overall summary, implications for practice and outlook.....	412
8.1 Overall summary	412
8.2 Implications for practice.....	425
8.3 Outlook.....	430
Appendix	432
Bibliography	517
List of References	582
Index.....	593

Table of Contents – Details

Author.....	III
Table of Contents – Overview.....	V
Table of Contents – Details.....	VII
Table of Figures.....	XI
List of Abbreviations.....	XVII
1 Introduction.....	1
1.1 Problem Statement and Research Needs.....	1
1.2 Targets and Theoretical Framework of Reference.....	8
1.3 Scientific Method and Process of Investigation.....	14
2 Conceptual Basis.....	23
2.1 Asset Management.....	23
2.1.1 Definition and Scope.....	23
2.1.2 Typology and Segmentation.....	24
2.1.3 Market Size and Structure.....	28
2.2 Institutional Investors.....	30
2.2.1 Definition and Scope.....	30
2.2.2 Typology and Segmentation.....	32
2.2.3 Market Size and Structure.....	34
2.3 Investment Consulting.....	37
2.3.1 Definition and Scope.....	37
2.3.2 Typology and Segmentation.....	43
2.3.3 Market Size and Structure.....	48
2.4 Summary.....	51
3 Defining Dimensions of Demand.....	53
3.1 Scientific Components of Explanation.....	53
3.1.1 Information Economics.....	55
3.1.2 Transaction Cost Theory.....	59
3.1.3 Property Rights Theory.....	62
3.1.4 Principal Agent Theory.....	64
3.2 Practice-Oriented Explanation Components.....	71
3.2.1 Concept of Fiduciary.....	71
3.2.2 Concept of Trusteeship.....	75
3.2.3 Further Practice-Oriented Explanation Components.....	82
3.3 Summary.....	87

4	Service Components of Supply	89
4.1	Business Model and Value Chain	89
4.1.1	Definition of Investment Policy	93
4.1.2	Asset-Liability Analysis	98
4.1.3	Strategic Asset Allocation	102
4.1.4	Manager Selection, Allocation, and Monitoring	111
4.1.5	Implementation	118
4.1.6	Investment Controlling	122
4.2	Manager Selection	125
4.2.1	Due Diligence	125
4.2.2	Manager Selection Process	127
4.2.2.1	Universe	129
4.2.2.2	Long List	129
4.2.2.3	Short List	130
4.2.2.4	Final list	130
4.2.3	Instruments of Manager Selection	131
4.2.3.1	Databases	131
4.2.3.2	Request for Information (RFI)	133
4.2.3.3	Request for Proposal (RFP)	134
4.2.3.4	Research Interview	138
4.2.3.5	On-site Visit	139
4.2.3.6	Beauty Contest	140
4.2.4	Criteria of Manager Selection	141
4.2.4.1	People (Individuals and Organization)	142
4.2.4.1.1	Qualification and Experience	144
4.2.4.1.2	Team- and Organizational Structure	146
4.2.4.1.3	Corporate Culture and Compensation System	150
4.2.4.1.4	Business Model and Focus	154
4.2.4.2	Philosophy (Investment Philosophy)	154
4.2.4.2.1	Active or Passive	157
4.2.4.2.2	Top-down or Bottom-up	158
4.2.4.2.3	Qualitative or Quantitative	159
4.2.4.3	Process (Investment Process)	160
4.2.4.3.1	Research	161
4.2.4.3.2	Portfolio Construction	162
4.2.4.3.3	Portfolio Implementation	164
4.2.4.3.4	Risk Management	166
4.2.4.4	Performance (Value Development)	167
4.2.4.4.1	Measuring Return	169
4.2.4.4.2	Risk Measurement	170
4.2.4.4.3	Absolute Risk-Adjusted Performance	172
4.2.4.4.4	Relative Risk-Adjusted Performance	173
4.2.4.4.5	Performance-Attribution Analysis	176
4.2.4.4.6	Peer Group Analysis	177

4.2.4.5	Product (Product Properties).....	178
4.2.4.5.1	Universe	178
4.2.4.5.2	Style.....	179
4.2.4.5.3	Size.....	182
4.2.4.6	Pricing (Compensation Models).....	184
4.2.4.6.1	Fixed Management Compensation.....	187
4.2.4.6.2	Variable management compensation	188
4.2.4.6.3	Transaction Costs.....	190
4.2.5	Assessment Systematics of Manager Selection	192
4.2.5.1	Scoring Instruments in Theory	192
4.2.5.2	Credit Points System for Practical Purposes.....	193
4.3	Summary.....	199
5	Definition of Environmental Dimensions	201
5.1	Exogenous Trends and Drivers.....	203
5.1.1	Business Model Influence Factors	203
5.1.2	Manager Selection Influence Factors.....	208
5.2	Endogenous Trends and Drivers.....	213
5.2.1	Business Model Influence Factors	213
5.2.2	Manager Selection Influence Factors.....	219
5.3	Summary.....	221
6	Defining Dimensions of Interactions	223
6.1	Provider Selection in Investment Consulting.....	223
6.1.1	Instruments of Selection.....	226
6.1.2	Selection Criteria.....	229
6.2	Dealing with Providers in Investment Consulting	236
6.2.1	Perspective of Institutional Investors.....	236
6.2.2	Perspective of Asset Managers	237
6.3	Value-added by Investment Consulting.....	240
6.3.1	Qualitative Value-added.....	244
6.3.2	Quantitative Value-added.....	247
6.4	Summary.....	254
7	Empirical Investigation into Investment Consulting.....	256
7.1	Objectives of the Empirical Investigation.....	256
7.2	Subjects and Scope of the Empirical Investigation	258
7.2.1	Design of the Empirical Investigation	258
7.2.1.1	Type and Structure of the Survey Instrument.....	258
7.2.1.2	Type and Structure of Sampling.....	261
7.2.1.3	Survey Process and Management	264
7.2.2	Design of Data Evaluation.....	275
7.3	Empirical Investigation – The Results	281
7.3.1	Analysis of Responses.....	281

7.3.1.1	Structure of Responses.....	281
7.3.1.2	Categorization of Participants	286
7.3.2	Analysis of Demand	298
7.3.2.1	Concept of Fiduciary	299
7.3.2.2	Concept of Trusteeship	300
7.3.2.3	Other Explanation Components	302
7.3.3	Analysis of Supply.....	305
7.3.3.1	Business Model and Value Chain	305
7.3.3.2	Manager Selection	317
7.3.3.2.1	Process of Manager Selection.....	317
7.3.3.2.2	Instruments of Manager Selection.....	320
7.3.3.2.3	Criteria of Manager Selection	323
7.3.4	Environmental Analysis.....	330
7.3.4.1	Exogenous Trends and Drivers.....	330
7.3.4.1.1	Business Model Influence Factors.....	330
7.3.4.1.2	Manager Selection Influence Factors	348
7.3.4.2	Endogenous Trends and Drivers.....	349
7.3.4.2.1	Business Model Influence Factors.....	349
7.3.4.2.2	Manager Selection Influence Factors	357
7.3.5	Analysis of Interactions	358
7.3.5.1	Selection of Investment Consulting Providers.....	358
7.3.5.1.1	Selection Tools	358
7.3.5.1.2	Selection Criteria	359
7.3.5.2	Dealing with Providers of Investment Consulting	366
7.3.5.2.1	Perspective of Institutional Investors	367
7.3.5.2.2	Asset Manager Perspective.....	371
7.3.5.3	Value-added by Investment Consulting.....	379
7.3.5.3.1	Qualitative Value-Added	380
7.3.5.3.2	Quantitative Value-added	391
7.4	Summary.....	398
8	Overall summary, implications for practice and outlook.....	412
8.1	Overall summary	412
8.2	Implications for practice.....	425
8.3	Outlook.....	430
	Appendix	432
	Bibliography	517
	List of References	582
	Index.....	593

Table of Figures

Fig. 1-1: Theoretical framework, delineation and positioning.....	11
Fig. 1-2: Quadrant model of scientific research.....	17
Fig. 1-3: Rigor and relevance of scientific endeavour.	19
Fig. 1-4: Logical process of investigation – methodological and sequential course.....	22
Fig. 2-5: Typological criteria of asset management companies.	25
Fig. 2-6: Business models continuum of asset management companies.	26
Fig. 2-7: Ranking of 'Top 20' largest asset managers worldwide.	29
Fig. 2-8: Typological criteria for institutional investors.....	32
Fig. 2-9: Assets development of institutional investors in trillion USD.....	34
Fig. 2-10: Ranking of the 'Top 20' institutional investors worldwide.	36
Fig. 2-11: Tasks, functions, and roles of consultants.	40
Fig. 2-12: Investment consulting within the context of various consulting services.....	42
Fig. 2-13: Founding years of important consulting companies.....	44
Fig. 2-14: Development periods and stages in the consulting market.....	45
Fig. 2-15: The 'Top 10' consultants worldwide according to segments.	46
Fig. 2-16: Typologization criteria of investment consultants.....	48
Fig. 2-17: Ranking of the 'Top 20' investment consultants in the USA.....	50
Fig. 3-18: 'Mind Map' as basis of new institutional economics.	53
Fig. 3-19: Subspecialties of new institutional economics in comparison.....	54
Fig. 3-20: Basic types of asymmetrical information.....	57
Fig. 3-21: Problem types of the principal agent theory.....	66
Fig. 3-22: Defining dimensions of decision-making by a trustee.....	78
Fig. 3-23: Model of the organizational structure of a trusteeship.	80
Fig. 3-24: Factors of 'best-practice-governance'.	81
Fig. 3-25: Complexity of investment strategy and uncertainty of asset classes.	84
Fig. 4-26: Integrated value chain in investment consulting.	90
Fig. 4-27: Characteristics of the value-creation steps in investment consulting.....	91
Fig. 4-28: Use of investment consultant services in the USA.....	92
Fig. 4-29: Use of investment consultant services in Pan-Europe.....	92
Fig. 4-30: Examples for the formulation of investment objectives.	96
Fig. 4-31: Generic model of asset-liability management.	101
Fig. 4-32: Comparison of sponsors' strategic asset allocation.....	104
Fig. 4-33: Categorization of higher-order risk in asset allocation.	107
Fig. 4-34: Performance effects of asset manager exchanges.....	117
Fig. 4-35: Implementation aspects.	119

Fig. 4-36: Transition management process.....	121
Fig. 4-37: Function levels of investment controlling.	123
Fig. 4-38: Hierarchical organization of investment controlling.....	124
Fig. 4-39: Manager selection process.	128
Fig. 4-40: Databases for manager selection.	132
Fig. 4-41: The '6-P approach'	142
Fig. 4-42: Significance and effect of the criterion 'people'	143
Fig. 4-43: Personality traits to generate alpha.....	145
Fig. 4-44: Organizational forms in portfolio management.	147
Fig. 4-45: Characteristics of the corporate culture of asset managers.....	153
Fig. 4-46: Exemplary integrated investment process.	160
Fig. 4-47: Exemplary process of portfolio implementation.	165
Fig. 4-48: Relation between alpha and tracking error.	171
Fig. 4-49: Active vs. passive management in the example of a bond portfolio.	171
Fig. 4-50: Use of measures of absolute performance.	173
Fig. 4-51: Use of measures of relative performance.	174
Fig. 4-52: Rolling averages of composite information ratios.	175
Fig. 4-53: Methods of analyzing alpha as well as their use.....	176
Fig. 4-54: Style box (stocks).....	180
Fig. 4-55: Frequency of use of style analyses.....	182
Fig. 4-56: Connection between 'size' and 'skill.'	184
Fig. 4-57: Correlation between information ratio and compensation	185
Fig. 4-58: Use of fixed and variable management compensation.	187
Fig. 4-59: Schematic effect of a performance fee.	188
Fig. 4-60: Incentive systems for the alignment of interests.	189
Fig. 4-61: Components of securities transaction costs.....	192
Fig. 4-62: Credit points system.....	195
Fig. 4-63: Manager rating scorecard.	196
Fig. 4-64: Manager rating tableau.	197
Fig. 4-65: Assessment based on the '6-P approach.'	198
Fig. 5-66: Exogenous and endogenous trends and drivers in investment consulting.	201
Fig. 5-67: Fiduciary Management.....	204
Fig. 5-68: Alpha/beta-separation.....	209
Fig. 5-69: 'Asset-barbell'.....	211
Fig. 5-70: Growth of alternative asset classes.	212
Fig. 6-71: Investment consultant selection process.	227
Fig. 6-72: Ideal investment consultant attributes.....	229

Fig. 6-73: Investment consulting evaluation approaches.	242
Fig. 6-74: Value added through innovations and increase of the value-added range.	247
Fig. 6-75: Performance measurement of value-added by manager selection.	249
Fig. 6-76: The 'food chain' i.e. cost components in asset management.	252
Fig. 7-77: Investigation steps – empirical validation of the theory.	257
Fig. 7-78: Worldwide distribution of samples (matrix of regions).	263
Fig. 7-79: Survey process and management.	264
Fig. 7-80: Data sources of survey samples.	265
Fig. 7-81: Online survey – personalized invitation email.	266
Fig. 7-82: Effectiveness of the incentive to receive the results free of charge.	267
Fig. 7-83: E-mail account portal for survey management.	269
Fig. 7-84: 'Cockpit' of the online account for management survey.	270
Fig. 7-85: Proprietary starting page of the internet based online survey.	271
Fig. 7-86: First page of the online questionnaire.	272
Fig. 7-87: Amount of contacts and responses over time.	273
Fig. 7-88: Statistical analysis dependent on scale levels.	277
Fig. 7-89: Error probability, significance levels and confidence levels.	279
Fig. 7-90: Statistical tests for various samples and scales.	279
Fig. 7-91: Worldwide distribution of survey participants (world map).	281
Fig. 7-92: Worldwide distribution of participants (matrix of regions).	282
Fig. 7-93: Worldwide distribution of participants (matrix of countries).	283
Fig. 7-94: Worldwide sample response rate (regional matrix).	284
Fig. 7-95: Functions of participants (investment consultants/ asset managers).	285
Fig. 7-96: Hierarchical positions of the participants.	286
Fig. 7-97: Segments of the participating group of institutional investors.	287
Fig. 7-98: Client structure of investment consultants – size categories.	288
Fig. 7-99: Size categories (AuM/ AuA/ market share) of the groups of participants.	289
Fig. 7-100: Investment consultants – structure of locations and employees.	291
Fig. 7-101: Investment consultants - internationality vs. business model.	293
Fig. 7-102: Investment consultants - independence vs. ownership structure.	294
Fig. 7-103: Client structure of asset managers according to size categories.	295
Fig. 7-104: Asset managers - internationality vs. business models.	296
Fig. 7-105: Asset managers – independence vs. ownership structure.	297
Fig. 7-106: 'Concept of Fiduciary' as a demand-inducing element.	299
Fig. 7-107: Concept of trusteeship as demand-inducing element.	301
Fig. 7-108: Practice-oriented explanation components of demand (part 1).	303
Fig. 7-109: Practice-oriented explanation components of demand (part 2).	305

Fig. 7-110: Comparison between supply and demand of services.....	307
Fig. 7-111: Asset categories – Comparison between supply and demand.	309
Fig. 7-112: SWOT- analysis of exogenous factors.....	312
Fig. 7-113: SWOT analysis of endogenous factors.....	313
Fig. 7-114: Comparison of compensation variants.....	316
Fig. 7-115: Types of manager research – frequencies of application.	318
Fig. 7-116: Number of 'listed' asset managers per selection stage.....	319
Fig. 7-117: Decision-making influence per selection stage.....	319
Fig. 7-118: Segment of employees working only in manager research.	321
Fig. 7-119: Frequencies of applied instruments in comparison.....	322
Fig. 7-120: Number of 'listed' asset managers per instrument.....	323
Fig. 7-121: Significance of the '6-P-criteria' (worldwide and regional perspectives). ..	324
Fig. 7-122: Significance of the criteria 'people' and 'philosophy' (worldwide).	326
Fig. 7-123: Significance of the criteria 'people' and 'philosophy' (by regions).	327
Fig. 7-124: Significance of the criteria 'process' and 'performance' (worldwide).	328
Fig. 7-125: Significance of the criteria 'process' and 'performance' (regional).	328
Fig. 7-126: Significance of the criteria 'product' and 'pricing' (worldwide).	329
Fig. 7-127: Significance of the criteria 'product' and 'pricing' (regional).	329
Fig. 7-128: Legal requirement to use investment consultants.....	331
Fig. 7-129: Market propensity to spend ('consumerism') for investment consulting....	333
Fig. 7-130: Market structures – number of providers.	334
Fig. 7-131: Domination of local vs. global investment consultants.....	334
Fig. 7-132: Estimates of market share in manager selection.	337
Fig. 7-133: Investment consulting market development expectations.....	338
Fig. 7-134: Manager selection market development expectations.	339
Fig. 7-135: Business model trends in asset management (1).	341
Fig. 7-136: Business model trends in asset management (2).	342
Fig. 7-137: Products and services - trends in asset management (1).	343
Fig. 7-138: Products and services - trends in asset management (2).	344
Fig. 7-139: Profitability of investment consulting and asset management.	345
Fig. 7-140: Merger of IC and AM – does it make sense?.....	346
Fig. 7-141: Trends in investment consulting (Part 1).....	351
Fig. 7-142: Trends in investment consulting (Part 2).....	352
Fig. 7-143: Level of investment consultant sophistication.	353
Fig. 7-144: Implemented consulting versus manager of managers.	355
Fig. 7-145: Instruments for the selection of investment consultants.	359
Fig. 7-146: Investment consultant selection criteria (part 1).....	360

Fig. 7-147: Investment consultant selection criteria (part 2).....	361
Fig. 7-148: Investment consulting industry standards (part 1).	362
Fig. 7-149: Investment consulting industry standards (part 2).	363
Fig. 7-150: Potential conflicts of interest in investment consulting.	365
Fig. 7-151: Reasons against hiring an investment consultant as fiduciary manager.	366
Fig. 7-152: Number of mandated investment consultants.....	368
Fig. 7-153: Preferred business models.	368
Fig. 7-154: Duration of mandate vs. size of institutional investor.	369
Fig. 7-155: Investment consultants – types of mandating.....	370
Fig. 7-156: Firm vs. individual consultant comparison.	371
Fig. 7-157: Amount of databases filled per asset manager.....	372
Fig. 7-158: Amount of listed investment consultants per asset manager.....	373
Fig. 7-159: Types of consultant relationships by asset managers.	374
Fig. 7-160: Existence of a team specialized on the needs of investment consultants.....	375
Fig. 7-161: Feedback culture of investment consultants.	376
Fig. 7-162: Contact frequency of asset managers.	377
Fig. 7-163: Future management of relations with investment consultants.	378
Fig. 7-164: Quality of cooperation with investment consultants.	379
Fig. 7-165: Significance of qualitative criteria in measuring added value (1).	381
Fig. 7-166: Significance of qualitative criteria in measuring added value (2).	382
Fig. 7-167: Satisfaction with qualitative criteria for measuring added value (1).	383
Fig. 7-168: Satisfaction with qualitative criteria for measuring added value (2).	384
Fig. 7-169: Qualitative criteria of added value: significance vs. satisfaction (1).	385
Fig. 7-170: Qualitative criteria of added value: significance vs. satisfaction (2).	386
Fig. 7-171: Satisfaction with services used (part 1).....	388
Fig. 7-172: Satisfaction with services used (part 2).....	389
Fig. 7-173: Services, for which investment consultants are preferred.....	390
Fig. 7-174: Significance of quantitative criteria to measure added value.	391
Fig. 7-175: Satisfaction with quantitative criteria to measure added value.	392
Fig. 7-176: Quantitative criteria of added value: importance vs. satisfaction.	393
Fig. 7-177: Significance of investment consulting as a ‘door opener.’	394
Fig. 7-178: Importance of investment consulting to business success.	395
Fig. 7-179: Importance of investment consulting according to segments (1).	396
Fig. 7-180: Significance of investment consulting according to segments (2).....	397